

Contents

Introduction

Executive Summary

Survey Purpose and Methodology

Follow-up survey of dealers identified to have been dealing in tiger parts and products prior to the trade regulation

1. Tiger bone
2. Medicines containing tiger bone
3. Tiger bone wine
4. Tiger penis
5. Aphrodisiacs containing tiger penis
6. Liquor of preserved tiger penis
7. Others
8. Summary

Survey of dealers newly sampled after the introduction of the regulation

1. Tiger bone
2. Medicines containing tiger bone
3. Tiger bone wine
4. Tiger penis
5. Aphrodisiacs containing tiger penis
6. Liquor of preserved tiger penis
7. Summary

Follow-up of the tiger farm in Japan

Conclusion - Evaluation of the effect of the government's new regulation

Recommendation

Annex

Introduction

Japan is the second biggest importer of wild species listed in the Appendices of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES).

Japan may have been involved with certain volume of the illegal international trade of tiger parts and products, also. In 1994, there were 144 seizures of imports at customs. This figure is 7% of the total number (2,200) of stopped imports in reference to CITES. (Data: The Customs Bureau of the Ministry of Finance)

The report of the Tiger Technical Mission at the 42nd Standing Committee of CITES in Lisbon 1999 criticised the attitude of Japanese government on the conservation and trade of tiger and also pointed out the need for considerable improvement. At the 11th meeting of the Conference of Parties in Gigiri, Kenya, Japanese government reported new internal correspondence on this issue. (Doc.11.30)

The main correspondence is an amendment of cabinet order for implementation of domestic law or “the Law for the Conservation of Endangered Species of wild fauna and flora”(LCES) concerning new regulation of the domestic trade in tiger bone, penis and their products (enforced April 2000). However, the trade of registered pre-ban stocks is still possible under this law, so there is a risk of stimulating the demand. Accordingly the government advised the dealers to stop the sale and display, apart from the regulation itself.

The purpose of this report is to assess the effectiveness of Japanese government’s regulation based on the results of the original investigation of tiger parts and products available in Japan.

Executive Summary

Even after the new regulation, in large cities at least over 20% of traditional medicine dealers are possibly selling tiger parts and products. Nearly half of the dealers which was selling tiger bone wine before the regulation continue marketing the product. Most of them are aware of the regulation and its implications, but they continue their business manipulatively. There are even those who obtained a fresh stock of tiger parts or products after the regulation was put into place.

There is no effective monitoring measures taken to prevent the possible marketing of tiger parts from the tiger farm exists in Japan. A new threat revealed as a result of this study is PR and marketing of tiger part products through internet. There is an increasing number of websites which publicise and market tiger part products such as tiger bone wine and plasters, or offer trade agent service for personal import of such products. One dealer referred that the product is valuable because of CITES ban. There is a risk that the stocks of tiger part products with traditional medicine pharmacies may also start to be traded through a different marketing route with help of internet.

In short, judging from the above findings, unfortunately the only conclusion is that the new regulation has not worked as effectively as it had been expected, for obvious reasons.

The first flaw of the regulation is that it allows dealers to continue holding their own stock of tiger parts and products. These stocked unregistered products are being marketed widely.

Therefore it is still not difficult to smuggle illegal tiger part products and distribute them in the Japanese market.

Secondly, following the introduction of the regulation, no efforts have been made by the government to properly monitor the marketing situation of tiger parts and their products, nor to take any appropriate enforcement measures.

Survey Purpose and Methodology

The purpose of the survey

The purpose of this survey is to clarify the condition of the trade of tiger parts and products in Japan and the correspondence of the dealers to the new regulation enforced in April 2000.

Survey period

January-May 2001

Survey Methodology

JWCS investigators pretended a buyer visited the traditional medicine shops and aphrodisiac shops to interview existence of tiger parts and their products, as well as their correspondence to the new regulation. (including a part of telephone survey)

The evidence for the findings was recorded in digital video film.

Selection of the dealers

JWCS selected 22 dealers located in Tokyo and Yokohama

(Kanagawa prefecture) which was confirmed the sale of tiger parts and derivatives by JWCS survey before the regulation, from May 1997 to October 1998, 1 mail order dealer confirmed the sale of tiger penis in May 1999.

JWCS newly selected 10 dealers in Tokyo, 20 in Kanagawa and 20 in Osaka at random from the traditional medicine shop in telephone directory. Actually JWCS visited 5 dealers in Tokyo, 20 in Kanawagawa and 18 in Osaka.

However, JWCS selected the dealers by priority treating crude drug of animals from the PR in telephone directory. Furthermore added the survey results of one seafood grocery store in Tokyo and one traditional medicine shop in Chiba prefecture JWCS investigators happen to visit.

JWCS searched the sale of tiger parts and products through some internet search engines and confirm the contents.

Follow-up survey of dealers identified to have been dealing in tiger parts and products prior to the trade regulation

1. Tiger bone

Survey findings prior to the trade regulation

During the survey conducted in and around Tokyo before introduction of the trade regulation ("Previous survey" hereafter), JWCS had found two traditional Chinese pharmacies (A-2, A-22) and one traditional Chinese clinic (A-12) to be dealing in tiger bones.

Follow-up survey following the trade regulation

During the follow-up survey conducted after introduction of the trade regulation ("Current survey" hereafter), tiger bone was still found on display at one of the aforementioned traditional pharmacies (A-22). During the previous survey staff of this pharmacy commented to JWCS that when we purchased tiger bone more than ten years ago, one piece cost some 50,000 yen(\$416), but nobody buys them these days,"but they retained the display. There was no price tag attached. During the current survey the tiger bone was found as before.

At the other pharmacy (A-2), the tiger bone observed during the previous survey was not found on display during the current survey. According to the owner of the pharmacy, he had had it on display for years as a "Treasure" of his shop. However, he withdrew it from the display as he was told to hide it by the section of pharmaceutical medical affairs of the prefectural government, who were anticipating the visit of the CITES Tiger Mission and British TV crew.

During the current survey, JWCS was not able to visit the other previously investigated site (traditional Chinese clinic - A-12).

2. Medicines containing tiger bone

Findings of the previous survey

During the previous survey before introduction of the trade regulation, JWCS had found six traditional pharmacies in Tokyo and one such pharmacy in Yokohama (Kanagawa Prefecture) to be dealing in tablets containing tiger bone. One of them (A-22) was found to be dealing in more than one brand.

Jokingan · 5 shops (A-4, A-8, A-9, A-10, A-22)

Katsurakutan · 1 shop (A-16)

Tochu kokotsugan · 1shop (A-22)

Findings of the current survey

During the current survey JWCS found that two of the above pharmacies were still dealing in the same pills containing tiger bone. One of them was found to be dealing in more than one brand.

Jokingan · 1 shop (A-22)

This was on sale at the same shop (A-22) which was selling another product, Tochu kokotsugan as below, and the stock at this shop was one box.

At one of the pharmacies run by the pharmaceutical company which was also involved in import and marketing of Jokingan, this product had been found to be in stock during the previous survey, but during the current survey following introduction of the trade regulation the pharmacy staff told JWCS investigation that they had disposed of the remaining stock.

Katsurakutan · 1 shop (A-16)

The stock at this pharmacy was two bottles, each costing 6,500 yen(\$54). This matched the quantity found during the previous survey in 1998.

Tochu kokotsugan · 1 shop (A-22)

This shop had 12 items of stock during the survey in February 1999 and 15 items in January 2001. The selling price was 3,600 yen (\$30) per box. The owner of this pharmacy had commented to JWCS in the 1999 survey that he normally purchases this product by the dozen. This implies that at least nine boxes have been sold in two years. This owner strongly recommended the JWCS investigator to buy the product as “It has been banned in China and cannot be imported any longer.”

The labelling of the ingredients and medical effects of this Tochu kokotsugan was all in Chinese. Selling such product is a violation of not only LCES but also “the Pharmaceutical Affairs Law”.

3. Tiger bone wine

Findings of the previous survey

During the previous survey before the introduction of the trade regulation, JWCS had identified 9 shops selling tiger bone wine: 5 traditional pharmacies in Tokyo and 3 in Yokohama, plus 1 Chinese restaurant in Tokyo. (A-1, A-2, A-3, A-4, A-11, A-13, A-14, A-15, A-21)

Findings of the current survey

During the current survey, of the above 9 shops JWCS found that 3 shops were still dealing in tiger bone wine: 1 traditional pharmacy in each of Tokyo and Yokohama, and 1 Chinese restaurant in Tokyo. (A-3, A-13, A-21)

A-3: One bottle was displayed in the show-window, but the shop owner said it was only the package for decoration with no contents. He also said, “we used to have more than a

hundred bottles but most of them were sold. Some customers bought them in dozens. I still have 4 or 5 bottles for personal use but they are not for sale.”

A-13: Tiger bone wine was kept in an inconspicuous place inside the shop. This shop had a stock of 7 small bottles (4,500 yen(\$37) each) and 1 smaller bottle (2,500 yen(\$20)). The clerk said “we could sell it for 6,500 yen(\$54) as this product is rare now..”

A-21: This Chinese restaurant, whose main attraction is a variety of rare Chinese drinks, used to have tiger bone wine on display before the trade regulation started, but the owner of the restaurant said that they had to take it from the showcase. However, tiger bone wine was still on their menu.

Among the pharmacies which no longer stocked tiger bone wine, one shop (A-14) said their head office had collected the remaining stock following the regulation and tiger bone wine could not be sold anymore. On the other hand, another pharmacy said “we may keep tiger bone wine as an example of traditional medicine, but since we are not allowed to sell we may use it as a gift”, implying the possibility that they pass on the wine with no monetary transaction.

4. Tiger penis

Findings of the previous survey

During the previous survey JWCS had found tiger penis products at 5 branches of two aphrodisiac companies with branches across Japan, and 1 Chinese grocery store in Yokohama. Also JWCS had discovered one company which was selling tiger penis by mail order.

Tiger penis: five aphrodisiac company branches (A-6, A-7, A-17, A-19, A-20), one Chinese grocery store (A-5), one mail order company (A-21)

Findings of the current survey

During the current survey JWCS confirmed the continued sale of tiger penis at the Chinese grocery store only (A-5).

The dealing in tiger penis at this grocery store was first found in September 1997. When visited again in August 1998 the investigators were told that it was out of stock. During the current survey, at first the investigators were told that there was no tiger penis, but after a bit of negotiation it was found to be still available. The selling price of one tiger penis was 15,000 yen (\$125), and they had two items in stock. The tiger penis was preserved in an alcoholic liquor stronger than 35% by volume. JWCS was told that the product would be regularly imported from Hong Kong in the future.

June 2000

A-19: The tiger penis was not on display, but when the investigators indicated their intention to buy one, the shop clerk brought one from the stock saying, “Normally we are not supposed to sell this but it is okay.” The price was 48,000 yen(\$40).

A-20: The other branch had 3 items in stock, each costing 48,000 yen(\$400). The shop clerk said, "It is 48,000 yen(more), but the rarity value makes it more expensive."

February 2001

A-19: At this point, the shop clerk said to the JWCS investigators that they could not put a tiger penis on display any longer, so they withdrew it from the shop and they did not have one anymore.

A-20: The shop clerk this time said, "we don't have any at all."

A-21: The mail order company identified during the previous survey now has a marketing site on the Internet . However, sale of tiger penis could not be confirmed through this site when accessed in May 2001.

5. Aphrodisiacs containing tiger penis

Findings of the previous survey

During the previous survey JWCS had found 2 branches of one aphrodisiac company and 1 mail order company dealing in aphrodisiac pills containing powdered tiger penis.

Ryukogen · 2 shops (A-6, A-7)

Sokkosei · 1 company (A-21)

Findings of the current survey

As a result of the current survey JWCS found that one of the two shops (A-6) was still selling Ryukogen brand, while internet survey of the net catalogue of the mail order company (A-21) did not reveal the sale of Sokkosei brand this time.

A-6: The label of the Ryukogen brand being sold at this branch does not mention tiger parts any more. However, the brand name and the price have not changed, and the shop staff explained that it contained powdered tiger penis.

6. Liquor of preserved tiger penis

Findings of the previous survey

During the previous survey, JWCS had found 1 Chinese restaurant and 3 branches of one aphrodisiac company dealing in liquor of preserved tiger penis.

Sanbenshu 1 shop (A-21)

Houraishu (tiger penis preserved in shochu, or distilled spirits) 4 shops (A-17, A-18, A-19, A-20)

Findings of the current survey

During the follow-up survey conducted in June 2000, "Houraishu" was still on sale at two branches of the aphrodisiac company.

A-19: The sales staff commented to JWCS that they had made the preserved tiger penis liquor ("Houraishu") upon request of some Chinese residents in Japan. The price of one bottle was

100,000 yen (\$833) (June 2000).

A-20: The price of "Houraishu" at this shop was 110,000 yen(\$916) per bottle. The sales staff said to JWCS, "Even with the regulation we are allowed to sell off those in stock. It does not require a registration, certificate or anything. We will issue a certificate stating it's been sold at this shop. That'd do within the country."(June 2000)

However, when JWCS visited these shops once again in January and February 2001, only one branch (A-19) still had the preserved tiger penis liquor.

A-19 (January 2001): The sales staff said to JWCS, "This bottle is the last one and reserved by an enthusiast already. We will not make it any more even upon request from customers." Furthermore the sales staff pointed out an orange packaged bottle on the shelf saying, "This wine contains tiger penis but it is not on sale." At that time the owner of this shop appeared and changed the topic of conversation.

7. Others ("glue")

Findings of the previous survey

During the previous survey JWCS had found 1 shop selling a "glue"of tiger called "Ohtenhatsu" which was on display.

Ohtenhatsu 1 shop (A-2): 2300 yen(\$19) per box, 28 items in stock. It can be ordered from Hong Kong and delivery takes two weeks (August 1998).

Findings of the current survey

During the current survey this shop was still found to be selling the same product.

Ohtanhatsu one shop (A-2): 5 labelled items and 2 unlabelled in stock. Selling price was 2,300 yen (\$19) each.

A2: It was not on display any longer but the sales staff brought one from the back of the shop.

The traditional Chinese pharmacist working at this shop said to the JWCS investigators "We don't keep this product on display as we don't want it photographed, but we are selling it." The labels of "Ohtenhatsu" had been removed intentionally. The pharmacist at the shop said, "We remove the labels because "tiger parts" might be mentioned even in foreign languages, and we keep our stock out of sight at the shop. You can make tiger bone wine by putting this product in 0.6-0.8 litres of shochu (a clear distilled liquor)."

8. Summary

As a result of the current survey, it has been revealed that many of the dealers who had been found dealing in tiger parts and/or tiger part products before introduction of the trade regulation still retain the stock and are marketing such products after the trade regulation came into force.

Regarding pills containing tiger bone, a number of dealers stopped dealing in them, but at the

same time there are those who continue importing the illegal pills even after introduction of the trade regulation. In the case of tiger penis and liquor of preserved tiger penis, while the aphrodisiacs companies who have been marketing such products at all of their branches across the country are gradually refraining from selling them, there is still a Chinese grocery store which carries on selling tiger penis. 44% (4 out of 9 shops) who had been identified to be dealing in tiger bone wine prior to the trade regulation were still marketing the products, including the one which sells glue of tiger as a substitute of tiger bone wine.

Most of these dealers are well aware of the trade regulation of tiger parts and products, but they continue their business inconspicuously and manipulatively. For example, they may not have such products on display but keep them behind till their customer show their special interest, some shops show tiger part products on display but their sales staff might insist they are not for sale, or some dealers remove labels from the package or remove just the mention of tiger penis from the label but explain verbally to customers that these products contain tiger parts.

Also, as a result of the current survey it was found that some dealers obtained fresh stock after introduction of the trade regulation. For example, this time one of the shops surveyed could show tiger penis which JWCS had been told had run out of stock during the previous survey, or another dealer apparently increased the number of tiger bone pills in stock compared to the time of the previous survey, and also a branch of an aphrodisiac company which had stopped dealing in tiger penis was found to be selling a new brand of liquor of penis for the first time only after introduction of the trade regulation.

Survey of the dealers newly sampled after the introduction of the regulation

1. Tiger bone

One shop of Kanagawa Prefecture is using tiger bone as a medical ingredient. It is not selling tiger bone untreated.

Tiger bone-1shop (B-8)

B-8: Pharmacist said "We imported tiger bone by ourselves. We are using it as an ingredient of medicine appropriate for the symptoms."

2. Medicine containing tiger bone

We confirmed that one shop in Kanagawa Prefecture is selling pills containing tiger bone.

Katsurakutan-1shop (B-22)

B-22: They have some stocks. The shop was quoted as saying "These are not for sale and we do not know how much they are" Five Websites selling medicines containing tiger bone (6 items are advertised)

(1)"Kaimahojingan" Internet sales (D-1)

Description says “Vigor tonic ·Made in China and legally imported as medicine to Japan. 300 pills 5,700 yen(\$47) · The importer , a big manufacturer of Chinese medicine, who is also importing “Jokingan”.

(2)“Kokotsu mukkagan” Internet sales (D-2)

Description says “Medicine for Rheumatism and neuralgia. Tiger bone strengthen muscles, cures rheumatism, and eases the pain of neuralgia.

(3)“Kokotsuko” Internet sales (D-2)

Description says “Medicine for numbness of legs and arms and muscle pains. Tiger bone is anti-inflammation, tranquilizer and painkiller. It also quickens the cure from broken bones.”

(4)“Ryuko jintan” Trade agent service for personal import (D-4)

No description of ingredients. It is manufactured by an old established aphrodisiac store in Fuzhou,Fujian Province, China and it is said to contain tiger bone. (Quote: “Index of Products Traditional Asian Medicines Identification Manual for Law Enforcers CITES”Plate.2.14.C)

(5)“Jako soukotsuko” Trade agent service for personal import(D-5)

(Musk Bone-Strengthening Plaster)

As an ingredient, leopard bone is shown. “Index of Products · Plate 1.2.4 says it contains tiger bone and leopard bone.

Description says “Medicine to ease pain and inflammation. One box includes 8 pieces of 7cm x 10 cm. 460 yen. Average use is one box a month.”

(6)“Tennen Jako soukotsuko” Internet sales (D-6)

(Natural Musk Bone-Strengthening Plaster)

Message says “This medicine is banned to be exported from China by CITES. In Japan only this shop is selling this product. Very rare medicine!!” “Eases inflammation and pain. One box (8cm x 13 cm 10 pcs.) 3000 yen (\$25). Made in Hubei Province, China” There was no description of ingredients. “Index of Products” Plate 1.2.A shows the plaster of the same trade mark, the same name and almost the same package contain tiger bone and leopard bone. The company is quoted as saying Tiger bone is included in this plaster by telephone survey by JWCS.

(7)“Jako soukotsuko” Trade agent service for personal import (D-8)

(Musk Bone- Strengthening Plaster)

Description shows leopard bone as an ingredient. 10 pcs. 1,200 yen(\$10).

(8)“Jako soukotsuko” Trade agent service for personal import (D-9)

(Musk Bone- Strengthening Plaster)

According to “Index of Products” Plate 1.2.A, It contains leopard bone. 200 pcs. 15,000 yen (\$125).

3.Tiger bone wine

We confirmed that in total 4 traditional medicine shops including one in Kanagawa, one in Chiba and 2 in Osaka, are selling tiger bone wine or liquor containing tiger bone.

Tiger bone wine-4shops (B-26, B-24, C-4, C-8)

B-26: 2 bottles of Tiger bone wine was stored at inconspicuous place. The label said they are not for sale.

B-24: 1 small bottle and 1 tiny bottle of tiger bone wine. The shop said "Since these are very old we are keeping but not selling. If we sell them it affects our reputation. They are sold well 3 or 4 years ago but these days no one buys them."

C-4: The shop is quoted as saying "We have old tiger bone wine. They are exhibited but there are few people who will recognize they are tiger bones. They are not for sale. We do not want to take any risks to sell them."(Telephone research)

C-8:When our investigator said he wanted to buy tiger bone wine, the shop took it out from the shelf, but saying it is troublesome to exhibit, he put it onto the shelf again quickly.

"There are some in China but we cannot bring them to Japan." "We cannot have a new stock any more, we want to sell it at 8000 yen (\$66) instead of 6000 yen (\$50). I wish there would be someone to buy it." They have 7 stocks.

There were 3 Chinese medicine shops that said they could get a new stock while they do not keep any stock now.

B-3:The shop is quoted as saying "Since wholesaler has tiger bone wine, I will call him if you really want it.

B-5: I can get tiger bone wine. I ordered it from a wholesaler 2 or 3 years ago. I have never got it recently" B-15:One shop is quoted as saying, "Tiger bone wine cannot be brought due to CITES regulations. If you buy it is not impossible to get some in stock on the condition you do not fail to buy it. I will get it in Hong Kong."

We could not confirm the website selling tiger bone wine. However, one introductory website of a traditional medicine shop advertise the shop with photos of tiger bone wine, saying that "we are dealing with traditional medicine using medicinal fauna and flora including tiger bone wine and extract of bamboo grass. There are people coming to buy them from far away." (D-3 Fukui Prefecture)

The introductory page of website made by Taiwanese restaurant advertises special liquor including more than 30 items of crude drug including tiger bone. (D7 Fukui Prefecture)

4. Tiger penis

In April of 2001 we found tiger penis being sold at 150,000 yen (\$1,250) at a seafood grocery we happened to visit. This shop has a great many stuffed and furs of Amur, Bengal and Sumatran tigers in stock. The shop is quoted as saying, "It became difficult to import tiger furs due to CITES. Recently we tried to bring the furs from Sumatra Island but could not clear customs. Russian sailor once brought us Siberian tiger's fur."(B-27)

5. Aphrodisiacs containing tiger penis

We could not confirm the sale of aphrodisiacs containing tiger penis.

6. Liquor containing preserved tiger penis

We could not confirm the liquor with tiger penis inside.

7. Summary

Among the total of 44 shops including 43 traditional medicine shops randomly selected and one shop we happened to visit, 9shops (21%) are selling tiger parts and products including 3 traditional medicine shops (B-3, B-5,B-15)that informed us that they could obtain a new stock while they did not have a stock at the moment. Main product for sale is tiger bone wine. The turnover is not inconsiderable. Considering that even only in the metropolitan area we researched there are a huge number of traditional medicine shops, we cannot eliminate the possibility that considerable amounts of produce may be dealt on the market. Also there was a case where a new stock will be acquired through illegal importation to meet the customer request.

Moreover we must not ignore the fact that Internet sales and advertisement of tiger parts and products as well as trade agent service for personal import are increasing continuously. The main products dealt with here are plasters rather than tiger bone wine and pills containing tiger bone. There is even a Website that put an emphasis on the rarity of tiger products due to trade ban by CITES. There were 2 Websites advertising trade agent service of plasters containing leopard bone.

The traditional medicine shop that claimed to be not selling tiger parts and products said "There was a movement to sell stocks between dealers inside the industry after the introduction of the regulation. Such movement is nothing to do with traditional medicine."(B-16) This information shows the risk that the stocks kept by traditional medicine shops may be sold through marketing routes other than drug stores like Internet sales.

Follow up of the tiger farm in Japan

"Kosanjo-en" (Siberian Tiger Park) of Hokkaido Island, which was advertised in pamphlets as "The biggest tiger park in the world - Medicinal Animal Breeding Farm," was producing and selling tiger bones and furs in 1980, while inviting tourists like a safari park. At the end of 1997 the number of the Amur tigers the park registered with Ripuchihi Zoo, a registry of the global breeding population of Amur tigers, an Amur tiger population of 47. However, it reported to Hokkaido Prefecture government the same year that the number of breeding tiger was 29. 2 years later, on the 18th June 1999, when Hokkaido Police inspected the park, the number of tiger had decreased to 9. There is still a sign there, that says, "Traditional metaphysical medicine for rejuvenation - Production of the crude drug Kokotsusanjo, and

medicinal fauna and flora park, Kosanjo-en(tiger bone and deer horn)”.

In May 1999, staff of Kamikawa Branch Office of the Hokkaido Prefecture government entered the farm for inspection according to the regulation on breeding dangerous animals under suspicion of unsafe tiger breeding at the facility. The park owner was charged with violating the dangerous animal regulation, but the indictment was suspended. Hokkaido Police could not find proof of the park's illegal trade in tiger parts and products (violation against LCES). At this point, the criminal action ended.

In May 2001, JWCS asked Kamikawa Branch Office about the subsequent status of the tiger farm.

Since the case of 1999, Kamikawa Branch Office enters the farm for inspection once a year to give it continuous administrative guidance. At the inspection of December 2000, the number of tiger in the farm was 5, which means 4 tigers died in one year. The owner claimed that the dead bodies had been buried, but Kamikawa Branch Office did not confirm the fact. Moreover Japanese Government (Ministry of Environment) did not give Kamikawa Branch any advise nor request regarding the treatment and trade of dead bodies.

Thus, since October 1999 there has been no action taken to monitor the drain on tiger parts and products from the farm.

Conclusion:

Evaluation of the effect of the government's new regulation

At the point of almost one year since the introduction of the new regulation, over 20% of traditional medicine dealers, in large cities at least, are possibly selling tiger parts and products, mainly tiger bone wine.

The percentage of dealers who stopped selling tiger parts and products after the introduction of the regulation system is not very high. Particularly in the case of tiger bone wine, nearly half of dealers continue marketing the product. Most of them are aware of the regulation and its implications, but they continue their business manipulatively. There are even those who obtained a fresh stock of tiger part products after the regulation was put into place.

On the other hand, in one and a half years between June 1999 and December 2000 at least four tigers are known to have died in a tiger farm in Japan, and it is not made clear how their body parts were disposed of. Most of raw materials of the products found during the current market study seem to have come from China or Hong Kong, and any possible route of tiger parts from this tiger farm into the traditional medicine market in Japan has not yet been ascertained. However, there are no effective monitoring measures being taken to prevent the possible marketing of tiger parts from this farm, and thus it cannot be guaranteed by any means that it is not happening.

A new threat revealed as a result of this study after the introduction of the new regulation was PR and marketing of tiger part products through the Internet. As if mocking the new regulation, there are an increasing number of websites advertising and marketing tiger part

products such as tiger bone wine and plasters, or offering trade agent service for personal import of such products. Moreover, some websites even emphasise the rarity value of tiger part products by referring to the CITES ban on international trade. The fact that by using the internet, tiger part products can be purchased without any difficulty and illegal selling and buying of such products cannot be detected easily, may be contributing to reduced customer hesitancy to purchase illegally. In addition, there is a risk that the stocks of tiger part products in traditional pharmacies may also start to be traded through a different marketing route other than pharmacies with the help of the internet.

How then can we evaluate the effect of the new regulation after one year since its introduction? In short, judging from the above findings, the only conclusion is that the new regulation has unfortunately not worked as effectively as had been expected, for obvious reasons:

The first flaw in the regulation is that it allows dealers to continue holding their own stocks of tiger parts and their products. It only aims to regulate transaction of products, except those imported legally under the CITES regulation and officially registered under the LCES of the Japanese government. However, it does not restrict storage, as opposed to trade, of unregistered products. The Japanese government issued the instruction for dealers to refrain from selling and displaying tiger part products, but in reality the unregistered stocks are being marketed widely. It is clear from the fact that there are some dealers who have obtained a fresh stock of tiger part products after the introduction of the new regulation that it is still not difficult to smuggle illegal tiger part products and distribute in the Japanese market.

Secondly, following the introduction of the regulation, no efforts have been made by the government to properly monitor the marketing situation of tiger parts and their products, nor to take any appropriate enforcement measures. Apparently the government notified traditional medicine pharmacists and major aphrodisiac dealers about the new regulation at least once. Some of those who stopped dealing in tiger part products following the introduction of the regulation seem to observe it seriously. However, those who continue marketing tiger parts and their products take no notice of the regulation, with confidence that there will be no punishment or backlash if they sell their products inconspicuously. Moreover, there are absolutely no regulations regarding marketing through websites.

Recommendation

Japanese Government should

- Call in and dispose of the stocks thoroughly which dealers, especially traditional medicine shops and aphrodisiac shops, have and hold, taking compensatory measures.

- Enforce legal conduct thoroughly through monitoring of the trade of tiger parts and products in Japan, including advertising on the Internet, and cataloguing disposal of the dead tigers in the tiger farm with evidence on a regular basis.
- Collect the information about the dealers who provide the trade agent service for tiger parts and products and enforce legal conduct for them through thorough checking at customs offices.
- Prepare a practical identification manual of traditional medicines of endangered species listed in CITES appendices, in which photographs of packages, the name of the product, manufacturer, ingredients and other information are listed.

Equip each department of organisations concerned, such as customs and police, with this manual.

ANNEX

Follow-up survey of dealers identified to have been dealing in tiger parts and products prior to the trade regulation (June 2000 to May 2001)

No.	Location	Before regulation (from May 1997 to June 1999)		After regulation (from June 2000 to May 2001)	
		Date	kind of products	Date	kind of products
A-1	Tokyo	May 1997	Bone Wine	Feb.2001	
		Aug 1998	Bone Wine		
A-2	Yokohama	Sept 1997	Bone Wine, Bone	Jan.2001	Others
		Aug 1998	Bone, Pills,Others		
A-3	Yokohama	Sept 1997	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	Bone Wine
		Aug 1998	Bone Wine		
A-4	Yokohama	Sept 1997	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	
		Aug 1998	Bone Wine, Pills		
A-5	Yokohama	Sept 1997	Penis	Jan.2001	
		Aug 1998		May 2001	
A-6	Tokyo	July 1998	Penis Pills	Feb.2001	Penis Pills
		Aug 1998	Penis, Penis Pills		
A-7	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Penis, Penis Pills	Jan.2001	
A-8	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Pills	Jan.2001	
A-9	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Pills	out of business	
A-10	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Pills	Jan.2001	
A-11	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	
A-12	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone	uninvestigated	
A-13	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	Bone Wine
A-14	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	
A-15	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	
A-16	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Pills	Jan.2001	Pills
A-17	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Penis, Penis Wine	Jan.2001	
		Oct 1998	Penis,		
A-18	Tokyo	Oct 1998	Penis Wine	uninvestigated	
A-19	Tokyo	Jun 1999	Penis, Penis Wine	June.2001	Penis ,Penis wine
		-		Feb.2001	Penis ,Penis wine
A-20	Tokyo	Jun 1999	Penis, Penis Wine	June.2001	Penis ,Penis wine
		-		Feb.2001	
A-21	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone Wine	Jan.2001	Bone Wine
A-22	Tokyo	Aug 1998	Bone, Pills	Jan.2001	Bone, Pills
		Feb 1999	Bone, Pills		
A-23	mail order	Nov 1998	Penis Pills	May . 2001	
		May 1999	Penis		

Survey of the dealers newly sampled after the introduction of the regulation (June 2000 to May 2001)

No.	location	Date	kind of products
B-1	Tokyo	Jan 2001	
B-2	Tokyo	Jan 2001	
B-3	Tokyo	Jan 2001	Bone wine(no stocks but available)
B-4	Tokyo	Jan 2001	
B-5	Tokyo	Feb 2001	Bone wine(no stocks but available)
B-6	Kanagawa	Mar 2001	
B-7	Kanagawa	Mar 2001	
B-8	Kanagawa	April 2001	Bone for drug products
B-9	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-10	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-11	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-12	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-13	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-14	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-15	Kanagawa	April 2001	Bone wine(no stocks but available)
B-16	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-17	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-18	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-19	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-20	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-21	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-22	Kanagawa	April 2001	Bone pill
B-23	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-24	Kanagawa	April 2001	Bone wine
B-25	Kanagawa	April 2001	
B-26	Chiba	Dec 2000	Bone wine
B-27	Tokyo	April 2001	Penis
C-1	Osaka	April 2001	
C-2	Osaka	April 2001	
C-3	Osaka	April 2001	
C-4	Osaka	April 2001	Bone wine
C-5	Osaka	April 2001	
C-6	Osaka	April 2001	
C-7	Osaka	April 2001	
C-8	Osaka	April 2001	Bone wine
C-9	Osaka	April 2001	
C-10	Osaka	April 2001	
C-11	Osaka	April 2001	

C-12	Osaka	April 2001	
C-13	Osaka	April 2001	
C-14	Osaka	April 2001	
C-15	Osaka	April 2001	
C-16	Osaka	April 2001	
C-17	Osaka	April 2001	
C-18	Osaka	April 2001	
D-1	Website	April 2001	Bone pill
D-2	Website	April 2001	Bone pill and plaster
D-3	Website	May 2001	Bone wine
D-4	Website	May 2001	Bone pill
D-5	Website	May 2001	plaster
D-6	Website	May 2001	plaster
D-7	Website	May 2001	Bone wine
D-8	Website	May 2001	plaster
D-9	Website	May 2001	plaster